



## Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Systematic Review of the Research Landscape



SPONSORED BY THE



Federal Ministry  
of Education  
and Research



Federal Institute for  
Vocational Education  
and Training



# Imprint

Further information on cooperation in vocational education and training:  
[www.govet.international](http://www.govet.international)

## Authors:

Björn Haßler | Inka Stock | Jens Schaffer | Enno Winkler | Assèta Kagambèga |  
Gesine Haseloff | Joe Watson | Melissa Marsden | Rebecca Gordon | Kalifa Damani

## Recommended citation:

Haßler, B., Haseloff, G., Adam, T., Akoojee, S., Allier-Gagneur, Z., Ayika, S., Bahloul, K., Changilwa Kigwilu, P., Da Costa, D., Damani, K., Gordon, R., Idris, A., Iseje, F., Jjuuko, R., Kagambèga, A., Khalayleh, A., Konayuma, G., Kunwufine, D., Langat, K., Lyimo, N., Marsden, M., Maseko, V., McBurnie, C., Orji, C., Powell, L., Schaffer, J., Simiyu, J., Stock, I., Tawene, E., Watson, J., Winkler, E. Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Systematic Review of the Research Landscape. VET Repository, Bundesinstitut für Berufsbildung, Bonn, Germany.

Creative Commons Licence CC BY 4.0.

urn:nbn:de:0035-vetrepository-775510-9

VET Repository: <https://lit.bibb.de/vufind/Record/DS-185338>.

[www.vet-repository.info](http://www.vet-repository.info)

Title photo: iStock/jonpic

Version 1 | November 2020



This report is available under a Creative Commons  
Licence (Attribution 4.0 International).

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/deed.de>

## Bibliographic information from the German National Library.

This web publication was registered and archived with the German National Library.  
urn:nbn:de:

# Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Systematic Review of the Research Landscape

Open Development and Education, October 2020

Haßler, B., Haseloff, G., Adam, T., Akoojee, S., Allier-Gagneur, Z., Ayika, S., Bahloul, K., Changilwa Kigwilu, P., Da Costa, D., Damani, K., Gordon, R., Idris, A., Iseje, F., Jjuuko, R., Kagambèga, A., Khalayleh, A., Konayuma, G., Kunwufine, D., Langat, K., Lyimo, N., Marsden, M., Maseko, V., McBurnie, C., Orji, C., Powell, L., Schaffer, J., Simiyu, J., Stock, I., Tawene, E., Watson, J., Winkler, E.

The education systems in most countries in Sub-Saharan Africa have very different levels of development. Particularly when it comes to technical and vocational education and training (TVET), which is required to work together with the economy and prepare young people for the labour market, many countries face very basic challenges. A critical weakness in the education offering from primary school to university level is the end of secondary school education — the connection to further education or the transition to the labour market. While the strength of well-developed TVET systems lies in initial education offerings in the vocational area, for the majority of African countries a “missing middle in post-school education” is postulated here (Lolwana 2017). As a result, a large number of young people are neither in training nor employment and there is little prospect of mitigating existing skill shortages. The regional differences are considerable; due to the complexity of the local circumstances, a general analysis of the problem can hardly do justice to the entire sector. This is also evident when attempting to capture an overall picture of TVET in Sub-Saharan Africa. There are already numerous studies and project reports at national and international level. However, these are scattered across institutions and regions and differ with regard to their research questions, empirical range, applied methods and quality.

For this reason, the Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF) commissioned a report to systematically review the existing research on TVET in Sub-Saharan Africa. The objective, among other things, was to get an extensive overview about research of TVET in Sub-Saharan Africa, to identify gaps in the research and provide impetus for further research and the formation of international research networks in TVET in Sub-Saharan Africa. On behalf of BMBF, GOVET supported an international and interdisciplinary team of authors with a systematic review of the literature, focusing research into vocational education and training in Sub-Saharan Africa, its institutionalisation, actors, networks and financing. In addition, the authors investigated the research topics themselves and examined the discussions about the TVET systems.

Alongside an extensive bibliography, this resulted in a 200-page report in German, which was published in 2019 (<https://lit.bibb.de/vufind/Record/DS-184013>). This English edition is an expanded and revised version of that report (<https://lit.bibb.de/vufind/Record/DS-185338>). Chapters 14 and 15 and appendices 2 and 3 regarding research design and the results of a structured community review (SCR) were added. Relevant results of the structured community review (SCR) and of expert interviews were incorporated into the relevant chapters. As a result, the interviewees have more of a chance to express themselves and to deliver valuable information on individual aspects of TVET research in Sub-Saharan Africa. Chapter 16 was fundamentally revised and provides a summary that deals with questions regarding future TVET research. Both the authors and the interviewed experts emphasize the particular importance of internationally networked TVET research. In order to take into account the work of the participants in the structured community review – i.e. contributions

<sup>1</sup> Lolwana, Peliwe: Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) in Sub-Saharan Africa: the missing middle in post-school education. In: Eicker, Friedhelm; Haseloff, Gesine; Lennartz, Bernd (ed.): Vocational Education and Training in Sub-Saharan Africa. Current Situation and Development. Bielefeld: W. Bertelsmann 2017, p. 11-24.

to the report itself – the list of authors of this English-language report was extended accordingly.

This summary document presents an extract from the report in the form of the table of contents and executive summary. The complete report and its extended, over-70-page-long bibliography can be downloaded in the TVET Repository (<https://lit.bibb.de/vufind/Record/DS-185338>). The TVET Repository is the central publication server for literature on vocational education and training. Here, the Federal Institute for Vocational Education and Training (BIBB) documentation team systematically documents the German-language specialist literature on all aspects of TVET and TVET research published since 1988. In addition to pure literature references, the TVET Repository contains a constantly growing stock of Open Access publications as a contribution to the important goal to continuously increase the proportion of full texts available free of charge and thus improve the supply of literature in the long term.

The authors of the TVET report argue that a major problem for researchers in Sub-Saharan Africa is access to knowledge, beginning with the simple act of finding scientific publications or project-related studies. Moreover, much of the TVET literature in Sub-Saharan Africa is so-called ‘grey literature’, referring to reports generated, for example, by international development cooperation projects; such literature usually requires ‘insider knowledge’ to discover. Institution-based TVET research as we know it from Europe, for example, only takes place to a limited extent. Furthermore, it became clear that the existing studies on TVET in Sub-Saharan Africa provide only somewhat reliable results – certainly, if the standards of good scientific practices in well-resourced economies are used as a benchmark. Nevertheless, the existing studies provide valuable insights and pointers for further research and allow conclusions to be drawn regarding the state of TVET research in Sub-Saharan Africa.

Modern information and communication technology is becoming increasingly important for the development of knowledge. For this reason, this report was intentionally published under an open content licence (Creative Commons Attribution). Readers are invited to freely download and distribute the report, and to use it as a basis for discussions in academic institutions, schools, at conferences, etc. Readers — including of course all of the authors themselves — can also freely adapt chapters and, e.g., use them for teaching. The report also offers a comprehensive bibliography, not only available in the PDF for the report, but also available in the free reference management system Zotero. This is a useful basis for future research and synthesis and we TVET practitioners and researchers to register free of charge ([https://www.zotero.org/groups/2317526/oden\\_tvetr-ssa/library](https://www.zotero.org/groups/2317526/oden_tvetr-ssa/library)). Indeed, we note that the report makes no claims to completeness; it transparently presents the methods used for review as well as the limitations encountered, and seeks to be a stepping stone for future TVET research. Through the TVET community engagement, the work on the report also laid an initial foundation for a network of TVET researchers in Sub-Saharan Africa (see <https://con.vet>).

The German Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF) is actively committed to international cooperation in vocational education and training. It is an important cooperation partner throughout the world for questions relating to TVET design and the further development of vocational training systems. A key objective of the international cooperation is to support partner countries in modernising their TVET systems, including establishing good education and research structures. Properly functioning research environments are a key prerequisite for innovation, competitiveness and social participation, for ensuring quality and comparability as well as permeability and equal opportunities, and for employment and economic growth. Within this framework, TVET research needs to meet both the requirement of rigour, while at the same time being relevant to the needs of the TVET sector.

same time offering significance to society; that is to say, supporting vocational training policy and practice to open new areas for personal and professional development of young people.

In this way, TVET research helps to find contributions to resolving urgent education-policy questions at various system, organisation and implementation levels. TVET research, as the fifth core element of the German dual system, enables evidence-based policy decisions and is represented in Germany by the Federal Institute for Vocational Education and Training (BIBB) and a wide network of research institutions and universities.

For this reason, the report is aimed at researchers and practitioners from technical and vocational education and training and related disciplines who are performing research in or about Sub-Saharan Africa as well as at interested members of the general public. The report on the status of TVET research in Sub-Saharan Africa provides a host of details and analyses on specific topics and approaches and is therefore a valuable foundation on which to base further research projects.

We now provide a short overview of the report. The report starts with an Executive Summary and the introductory Chapter 1, which is followed by Chapter 2 presenting the research design (methodological approach) of the report, including the research questions. It details the authors' approach to systematic literature reviews (including search terms / keywords, databases, grey literature) with an overview of the search methods employed (automated, opportunistic; email survey). Also included is the systematic review methodology, classification and coding (screening; relevance criteria, quality criteria) of the research publications. Chapter 2 closes with comments on the project languages and ethical issues.

Chapter 3 offers an overview of the quality and relevance of the publications found on TVET. After a broad and systematic search, around 300 of over 2,000 publications were classified as relevant to the research questions and therefore examined in more detail. About 5% of these were classified as particularly high-quality research and about 20% as high quality. The 300 publications come from different categories; around half of these are publications from peer-

reviewed journals (primary research and literature research). Other categories include edited books, dissertations and (project) reports. The chapter closes with an analysis of the choice of topics and examples of the diverse range of topics found.

Chapter 4 deals with the concept and practice of TVET. This chapter aims to create a common framework that unites different dimensions of TVET. The large number of TVET systems means that an analysis of their characteristics is complicated. The lack of a clear, comprehensive reference framework for TVET in SSA is particularly problematic from a research perspective. These dimensions are taken up again in various later chapters and discussed further.

Chapter 5 examines the various stakeholders in TVET research and their networks, e.g., the institutions that are involved in TVET and TVET research (e.g., faculties at universities as well as non-university and non-state colleges). The authors consider the motivations provided by TVET researchers as well as the countries or regions to which the publications on TVET research refer.

Chapter 6 deals with topics, perspectives and current debates of TVET research in SSA. The most important topics are selected from the earlier thematic analysis and discussed in detail. One of the issues is the definition and conceptualisation of TVET itself, providing additional context to Chapter 4. Starting from their own position developed in Chapter 4, the authors now look at additional perspectives, taking into account the opinions of TVET researchers, as well as the opinions of TVET students and TVET teachers.

Chapter 7 carries out a systematic review of the studies on TVET in SSA, i.e., it examines reliable statements made about TVET in relevant research publications. In Chapter 7, the subject of research is no longer the character of the research literature itself, but the content of the studies themselves.

Chapter 8 examines models for the design, development and delivery of TVET. For example, educational programme designs are examined with particular attention to practical components.

Chapter 9 looks at gender issues in TVET in SSA, as well as inclusion challenges and strategies. Publications from selected countries in SSA enable the authors to analyse governmental policies relating to the right of inclusion.

Chapter 10 looks at key state actors in TVET (state authorities and key policies) for four countries: Botswana, Ghana, Kenya and Nigeria. These countries reflect a diverse variety of TVET system structures.

Chapter 11 examines the importance of non-governmental actors in TVET from a range of countries where information was available, including Ethiopia, Botswana, Ghana, Kenya, Nigeria, Uganda and Tanzania.

Chapter 12 looks at national standards, guidelines and quality frameworks in TVET in SSA. The authors examine the role that politics, trade unions and other interest groups play in TVET.

Chapter 13 focuses on the challenges that arise when implementing guidelines and political decisions. The authors raise issues regarding the differences, opportunities and risks associated with the possible development of formal and informal TVET.

Chapter 14 focuses on how institutional framework conditions can be influenced to increase research capacity and performance. It also explores what the research interests and motivations of TVET researchers are in SSA, alongside the current and emerging TVET topics in the region.

In Chapter 15, we focus on networks for research into TVET. The chapter explores the networks and networking opportunities that are present across and beyond SSA and considers how those could be strengthened. Insights on the topic are presented from the experts who participated in the focus group discussions.

In Chapter 16, the authors offer a summary and — based on this — direct our attention to possible future developments regarding TVET and TVET research.

A number of appendices present additional information, such as an annotated bibliography, the full bibliography for the report, the methodology for the interviews and structured community review, the results of the structured community review (including focus group; i.e. the critique of an earlier version of this report), as well as links to additional materials.

# Contents

<b>Executive Summary</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>Chapter 1. Introduction: TVET Research in Sub-Saharan Africa</b>	<b>27</b>
1.1. Education and research in SSA	27
1.2. Systems approach and theory of change	28
1.3. The German Federal Government and TVET in SSA	29
1.4. Purpose and aim of this study	31
1.4.1. Systematic review of the state of research on TVET in SSA	31
1.4.2. Engagement with the community of TVET researchers and practitioners in SSA	32
1.5. Focus on TVET research in SSA	32
1.6. Note for the reader	35
1.7. Chapter bibliography	36
<b>Chapter 2. Research Design</b>	<b>38</b>
2.1. Research questions	39
2.1.1. Part A. About the research, research papers and reports	39
2.1.2. Part B. Themes, perspectives and current debates	39
2.1.3. Part C. Sector-mapping and actor analysis	40
2.1.4. Part D. National standards and regulations	40
2.2. Overall research design	40
2.3. Phase 1: Literature review	41
2.3.1. Activity 1a: Literature discovery and analysis	41
2.3.2. Activity 1b: Literature scoping: Online survey 1	47
2.3.3. Activity 1c: Literature analysis and synthesis	49
2.4. Interviews, surveys, reviews, focus groups	49
2.4.1. Activity 2a: Interviews	49
2.4.2. Activity 2b: Online survey 2	51
2.4.3. Activity 2c: Structured community review	53
2.4.4. Activity 2d: Focus groups	53
2.5. Further considerations	54
2.5.1. Project languages	54
2.5.2. Ethical issues	54
2.6. Chapter appendix	55
2.6.1. Research questions	55
2.6.2. Research questions for the interviews and focus groups	62
2.6.3. Discussion of the research questions	64
2.6.4. Research questions and chapters	67
2.7. Chapter bibliography	68
<b>Chapter 3. Overview of the Discovered Publications</b>	<b>71</b>
3.1. Sources of evidence	72
3.2. Automated search and discovery	72
3.2.1. Evaluation of research quality	73



3.3. Terminology used in this report	74
3.3.1. The U-list and the H-list	74
3.3.2. Assessment of research quality	74
3.3.3. Citations and countries	75
3.3.4. LMICs	75
3.3.5. Effectiveness and efficiency	75
3.3.6. Gender-neutral language	76
3.4. Description of genres	76
3.5. Description of various publications by genre	76
3.5.1. Description of the literature reviews	77
3.5.2. Multi-author volumes	77
3.5.3. Additional materials in Portuguese, French and German	78
3.5.4. Introductory publications	79
3.6. Internet search and policy analysis	80
3.7. Thematic analysis	82
3.8. Chapter bibliography	87
<b>Chapter 4. The Conception and Practice of TVET in Sub-Saharan Africa</b>	<b>93</b>
4.1. Working definition of TVET	96
4.1.1. Working definition: TVET college	97
4.2. Definition of TVET in the literature	97
4.2.1. TVET: Differing terms, same concept	98
4.3. TVET: Formal and informal	100
4.4. The cooperative and temporal dimensions	102
4.4.1. The dimension of cooperation	103
4.4.2. Untangling the temporal dimension	103
4.5. TVET: 'Expansive' and 'restrictive'	104
4.6. TVET: Education for a 'skilled, adaptable labour force'?	105
4.7. Professions and sectors of work included in TVET	106
4.7.1. Researcher survey: Professions included in TVET	106
4.7.2. Subgroups of the major occupational group referred to as 'professional'	107
4.7.3. Frequently occurring occupations in the research	108
4.8. Chapter bibliography	110
<b>Chapter 5. TVET Actors</b>	<b>114</b>
5.1. Participants in TVET research	117
5.2. Reasons for and factors in research in TVET	118
5.2.1. Societal challenges as motivation	118
5.2.2. Research gaps as motivation	121
5.3. Locations for TVET research	122
5.4. Financing TVET research	125
5.5. Current TVET projects	126
5.6. TVET research: Leading countries, institutions and experts	128

5.6.1. Leading countries	128
5.6.2. Leading institutions	129
5.6.3. Leading experts	129
5.7. Chapter bibliography	130
<b>Chapter 6. Themes, Perspectives and Current Debates in TVET Research</b>	<b>134</b>
6.1. Theme: Evidence-based understanding of specific interventions and programming	136
6.1.1. Focus: Evidence of the impact across and within countries	137
6.1.2. Focus: Evidence from and impact of TVET programmes	137
6.2. Theme: Types of TVET	138
6.2.1. Focus: TVET Policy	139
6.2.2. Focus: Regulating supply and demand through vocational training policy	140
6.2.3. Focus: TVET — a 'blind spot' of education policy	140
6.3. Theme: Region-specific features in TVET	141
6.4. Theme: TVET in relation to ICT	142
6.4.1. Focus: ICT use by teachers and institutions	143
6.4.2. Focus: Costs for the use of ICT and ODL	143
6.5. Theme: Institutions and personnel in TVET	143
6.5.1. Focus: Further perspectives on TVET	144
6.5.2. Focus: Perspectives of TVET students and TVET educators	144
6.5.3. Focus: The business perspective on TVET	144
6.6. Theme: Studies with recommendations for TVET research	145
6.7. Chapter bibliography	146
<b>Chapter 7. Systematic Review of TVET Research</b>	<b>154</b>
7.1. Design and methods in the U-publications (RQ6)	156
7.1.1. Overview of publication quality	156
7.1.2. Research design and methods	158
7.1.3. Methodical limitations in the analysed publications	159
7.1.4. Sampling	159
7.1.5. Data collection instruments	160
7.1.6. Structure and genre of the analysed publications	160
7.1.7. Clarity of writing and typographic aspects	160
7.1.8. Referencing	161
7.1.9. Note on descriptive publications	161
7.2. Studies with reliable results (14 studies)	161
7.3. Results of studies regarding key challenges of TVET (RQ11)	162
7.3.1. TVET facilities	162
7.3.2. TVET teachers / educators	163
7.3.3. Perceptions of TVET	164
7.4. Results of studies regarding TVET and ICT	165
7.4.1. The level of ICT use	165
7.4.2. Methods for promoting ICT use	166
7.4.3. Examples of delivery of TVET through ICT-based programmes	167
7.5. Recommendations regarding TVET policy	168
7.5.1. Recommendations regarding TVET policy	168
7.5.2. Recommendations regarding TVET providers	169
7.6. Recommendations of the studies regarding further research	170

7.6.1. Recommendations regarding research in cognate areas	170
7.6.2. Recommendations for follow-up research	171
7.6.2. Recommendations for replication studies	171
7.7. Chapter bibliography	173
<b>Chapter 8. Models for Designing, Developing and Delivering TVET</b>	<b>179</b>
8.1. Programmatic and pedagogical designs	181
8.1.1. Examples of formalised, college-based courses (Type K1)	182
8.1.2. Examples of formalised, dual-system approaches (Type K2)	182
8.1.3. Approaches to TVET entirely at the workplace (Type K3)	185
8.1.4. Examples of technology-driven and distance learning (Type Z4)	187
8.1.5. Examples of other continuing professional development and in-service approaches (Type Z5)	187
8.1.6. Recognising informal TVET	188
8.2. Pedagogical approaches	190
8.2.1. Interactive pedagogy: Authentic tasks	190
8.2.2. Non-interactive (lecture-focused) approaches	191
8.2.3. Information and communication technologies (ICT)	191
8.3. Findings relating to practical components of TVET	192
8.3.1. Education sector: Initial teacher professional learning	192
8.3.2. Health sector: Practical components	192
8.3.3. Practical components in apprenticeship contracts in Ghana	193
8.3.4. The lack of practical components in pre-service programmes	193
8.3.5. Short courses (CPD)	194
8.4. Chapter bibliography	196
<b>Chapter 9. Inclusion-related Challenges and Policies</b>	<b>203</b>
9.1. Gender	204
9.1.1. Women's access to education	204
9.1.2. Women in TVET	206
9.1.3. Women's employment and the labour market	208
9.1.4. Gender-based roles, career choices and gender stereotypes	209
9.1.5. Gender and teacher education	210
9.2. People with disabilities	211
9.3. Vulnerable groups	213
9.3.1. National qualifications programmes in Ghana	213
9.3.2. Affordable fees for disadvantaged students in Kenya	214
9.3.3. Media education in Eritrea	214
9.3.4. Policies in Botswana	215
9.3.5. Youth policies in Botswana, Ghana and Senegal	216
9.3.6. Refugees in Uganda	217
9.4. Chapter bibliography	218
<b>Chapter 10. State Authorities for TVET Management</b>	<b>222</b>
10.1. Authorities and policies: Botswana	223
10.1.1. State TVET authority	224
10.1.2. Key policies in Botswana	225
10.2. Authorities and policies: Ghana	225

10.2.1. State TVET authority	226
10.2.2. List of key policies in Ghana	226
10.3. Authorities and policies: Kenya	227
10.3.1. State TVET authority	228
10.3.2. List of key policies in Kenya	229
10.4. Authorities and policies: Nigeria	230
10.4.1. State TVET authority	230
10.4.2. List of key policies in Nigeria	231
10.5. Chapter bibliography	235
<b>Chapter 11. Non-state TVET Providers</b>	<b>240</b>
11.1. The prevalence of private education providers	241
11.1.1. Private education providers in Nigeria	242
11.1.2. Private education providers in Botswana	243
11.1.3. Private education providers in Ethiopia	243
11.1.4. Private education providers in Ghana	243
11.1.5. Private education providers in Kenya	243
11.1.6. Private education providers in Tanzania	244
11.1.7. Private education providers in Uganda	244
11.2. Participation and role of industry, commerce and other groups with interest in TVET	245
11.2.1. Insights from the literature	246
11.2.2. Insights from interviews and focus groups	246
11.2.3. Specific sectors	248
11.3. Chapter bibliography	249
<b>Chapter 12. National Standards and Regulations</b>	<b>251</b>
12.1. National qualifications frameworks for TVET	253
12.1.1. Scope of the standards	255
12.1.2. Pedagogical approaches promoted in qualification frameworks	255
12.1.3. Qualifications frameworks exclusively dedicated to TVET, and sector strategic plans	256
12.2. State regulation of TVET	257
12.2.1. Regulation in Botswana	258
12.2.2. Regulation in Nigeria	259
12.2.3. Regulation in Tanzania	260
12.2.4. Regulation in Uganda	260
12.3. Quality assurance and accreditation of TVET	260
12.3.1. Functions and responsibilities of state authorities	261
12.3.2. Monitoring of TVET standards in Botswana	263
12.3.3. Monitoring of TVET standards in Ghana	264
12.3.4. Monitoring of TVET standards in Kenya	264
12.3.5. Monitoring of TVET standards in Nigeria	265
12.3.6. Monitoring of TVET standards in South Africa	266
12.3.7. Monitoring of TVET standards in Uganda	266
12.4. Chapter bibliography	268

<b>Chapter 13. Challenges to Policy Implementation</b>	<b>273</b>
13.1. Evaluation of TVET policy implementation	275
13.1.1. Evaluation of TVET policy implementation: Kenya	275
13.1.2. Evaluation of TVET policy implementation: Nigeria	276
13.1.3. Evaluation of TVET policy implementation: South Africa	276
13.2. Formal sector: Impact of policies and regulations	277
13.3. Informal sector: Role, quality and examples	278
13.3.1. Quality of informal TVET	278
13.3.2. Informal TVET in Africa and its regions	279
13.3.3. Informal TVET in Botswana	280
13.3.4. Informal TVET in Ghana	281
13.3.5. Informal TVET in Kenya	281
13.3.6. Informal TVET in Mali	282
13.3.7. Informal TVET in Namibia	282
13.3.8. Informal TVET in Nigeria	283
13.3.9. Informal TVET in Uganda	283
13.3.10. Influence of legislation on informal TVET	284
13.4. The impact of policy regarding inclusion in TVET	284
13.5. Chapter bibliography	286
<b>Chapter 14. Insights Regarding Institutional Frameworks and Research Capacity</b>	<b>289</b>
14.1. Insights into institutional frameworks and research capacity	292
14.1.1. Institutional frameworks and research capacity	292
14.1.2. Improving research capacity and performance	294
14.2. Research interests and topics of the SCR participants	295
14.2.1. Insights regarding research interests	295
14.2.2. Insights regarding current and emerging research topics	298
14.2.3. TVET teacher education	299
14.2.4. Employment and industry	300
14.2.5. Equal access to TVET	301
14.2.6. Green TVET	301
14.2.7. Policy	302
14.2.8. ICT	302
14.3. Chapter bibliography	303
<b>Chapter 15. Research Networks and Capacity Building</b>	<b>304</b>
15.1. TVET-research networks, TVET networks and TVET cooperations	306
15.1.1. Working definitions: Cooperation and network	306
15.1.2. Overview of TVET research networks	307
15.1.3. Related networks: VETnet and ERNWACA	309
15.1.4. TVET-specific networks	309
15.1.5. TVET-specific cooperations	310
15.1.6. TVET conferences	311
15.1.7. Other relevant international organisations	313
15.1.8. Research funding	313

15.1.9. Wider networks in SSA	313
15.2. Network formation and the development of research capacities	315
15.3. Supporting the virtual research community	316
15.3.1. Virtual research community experiences	316
15.3.2. AfriTVET International Conference (June 2019)	318
15.3.3. Enabling participation in conferences	318
15.4. A closer examination of UNEVOC	320
15.4.1. UNEVOC Nigeria	321
15.4.2. UNEVOC Botswana	322
15.4.3. UNEVOC Kenya	323
15.4.4. Ghana: COTVET	324
15.5. Chapter bibliography	325
<b>Chapter 16. Perspectives on Future TVET Research</b>	<b>329</b>
16.1. Cross-cutting approaches for designing joint TVET research in SSA	329
16.1.1. TVET research needs to be broad and systematic	329
16.1.2. Accurate measures	330
16.1.3. TVET research needs to be long-term	330
16.1.4. Research in partnership, multilateralism and diversity	330
16.1.5. Applied and practical research	331
16.1.6. Approaches to funding TVET and TVET research	331
16.2. Topics and themes	332
16.2.1. Societal perspectives	332
16.2.2. Perspectives of industry and business	333
16.2.3. Information and Communication Technology in TVET	333
16.2.4. Align TVET research with the SDGs	334
16.3. Chapter bibliography	335
<b>Appendix 1: Annotated bibliography</b>	<b>336</b>
<b>Appendix 2. Research Design for the Interviews and Structured Community Review</b>	<b>365</b>
<b>Appendix 3. Results of the Structured Community Review</b>	<b>381</b>
<b>Appendix 4. Bibliography</b>	<b>389</b>
<b>Appendix 5. List of Additional Materials</b>	<b>465</b>



# Executive Summary<sup>1</sup>

This report reviews the state of research on technical and vocational education and training in sub-Saharan Africa (SSA). It is an extended and updated version of an earlier German report.<sup>2</sup> The original report features a systematic review of both academic and grey literature as well as other sources of information, such as other internet research. The present report extends the sources of information further by including interviews, focus groups and reflective artefact analysis. While both academic and grey literature offer significant insights, such other sources of information need to be considered, especially where sectors are under-researched. Our literature-based approach is, therefore, complemented by interviews, reflective artefact analysis — in the form of a structured community review — and focus groups. Overall, this report contributes to a deeper understanding of TVET research in SSA with a focus on the improvement and the development of TVET systems and research; ultimately it seeks to contribute to the achievement of the human development outcomes associated with technical and vocational education and training.

We note that we use the phrase ‘Technical and Vocational Education and Training’, abbreviated as TVET, in a broad sense that includes the range of approaches prevalent in SSA. This interpretation is not unique to this report (Lauterbach, et al., 2018)<sup>3</sup> but differs from other conceptions, such as the conception of TVET in Europe.<sup>4</sup> It should be emphasised that the present report provides a systematic overview of the available research on TVET in SSA between 2000 and mid-2019 (in English, French, Portuguese and German),

following the methodology outlined and subject to the usual limitations of such reviews. Therefore, this broad review is not necessarily representative of in-depth research in any one country in SSA. For instance, there were some documents and research papers that we were not able to access because they were not available online and the authors did not respond to our enquiries; some communities of researchers may have well access to these, but we were unable to retrieve them.

The variety of TVET systems, as well as the lack of a clear overarching definition of TVET, does have important ramifications regarding harmonisation and compatibility of different systems. However, it also complicates research and systems analysis. In order to capture this variety, this report develops a reference framework covering several dimensions, which are described in Chapter 4. In any one country, it is likely that various concepts and several forms of TVET coexist. This includes various formal and informal approaches. Options for international cooperation and alignment across such approaches need to be considered in the future. We also note that in many countries in SSA — as well as in European (Germany) and North American countries — forms of ‘technical and vocational’ education and ‘academic’ (‘higher/tertiary’) education are merging; future research should adopt broad definitions of TVET, TVET institutions and TVET research.

The transition from school to work is not without problems for many young people; well-designed TVET can ease this transition by lowering the threshold for

<sup>1</sup> Citation for this chapter: Haßler, Haseloff, et al. (2020). Executive Summary. In: Haßler, Haseloff, et al. (2020). Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Systematic Review of the Research Landscape. VET Repository, Bundesinstitut für Berufsbildung, Bonn, Germany. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3843340>.

<sup>2</sup> Haßler, et al. (2019). Berufsbildung in Sub-Sahara Afrika: Stand der Forschung (Berufsbildung in SSA). VET Repository, Bundesinstitut für Berufsbildung, Bonn, Germany. Available at: <https://lit.bibb.de/vufind/Record/DS-184013>

<sup>3</sup> Lauterbach, U. (2018). Die Schritte zu einer internationalen und international vergleichenden Berufsbildungsforschung. In F. Rauner & P. Grollmann (Eds.), Handbuch Berufsbildungsforschung (3. aktual. u. erw., p. 52). UTB.

<sup>4</sup> In other words, the term ‘berufliche Bildung’ (used in German-speaking countries) is translated with ‘technical and vocational education and training’, as Lauterbach recommends (Lauterbach, et al., 2018). Lauterbach refers to the UNESCO decision to use this term for both “vocational education and training (VET)” and “technical vocational education and training (TVET)”. In the EU, however, a distinction is made between VET and TVET (ibid.).



entry into the sphere of work. Therefore, a key aspect for TVET research is the transition from general education to TVET; this includes both initial TVET as well as further and continuing education. Indeed, many TVET researchers and TVET practitioners advocate meaningful, lifelong, professional learning that starts with general education and continues beyond initial TVET. However, in practice, many TVET systems and TVET institutions are not always able to meet these requirements.

It is important to note that this report is concerned with the state of TVET research in SSA, rather than purely with the state of TVET in SSA as such. While we are, of course, concerned with what TVET research has to say about the evidence regarding TVET, our overall focus is on issues surrounding TVET research. For example, we are not just concerned with TVET actors (and analysing the TVET system as such); we are also concerned with TVET researchers (and TVET research systems). The following sections will summarise the conclusions reached by taking this approach.

## Themes, perspectives and current debates in TVET research

The literature review, interviews and focus groups identified various themes, perspectives and current debates. Our first important observation is that there is no common definition and concept for TVET valid in all countries or regions in SSA. This is due to the fact that evidence-based insights from the reviewed publications stem mainly from research on specific interventions and TVET programmes with a national or international focus; they do not tend to research overarching definitions and do not seek to elaborate frameworks.

A clear theme is a need for TVET — as well as TVET-teacher professional development — to be as

practical and as practice-focused as possible. Other themes include the tension between TVET policy and practice, the importance of researching demand-driven TVET, and of research on future possibilities and aspirations for TVET: arguably, policy has not kept pace with such demands. Another important topic in TVET research is Information and Communication Technology (ICT). The publications reviewed future possibilities, applications, benefits and costs of ICT in TVET. Utilising technology to evaluate TVET is also discussed as an important aspect. A further theme is the importance of evidence-based understanding of specific TVET interventions and TVET programmes, which is apparent in a significant number of publications.

Expert participants in our interviews and focus groups highlighted several additional current and emerging topics in TVET research. Greater access and equality in TVET were identified as requiring further research, particularly with regard to women and immigrants. Other topics raised were the aforementioned links between theoretical and practical elements in TVET, the perception of TVET, curriculum and skills development, TVET teacher education, policy and ICT. Green TVET is another research area highlighted as emerging by the participants. The topic appears to be gaining prominence because of UNESCO / UNEVOC advocacy for research in the field.

The expert participants also shared their own thematic interests and motivation for participating in TVET research. Participants expressed interest in research exploring the integration of theoretical and practical elements of TVET, the 'dual TVET system', increased focus on the professionalisation of the workforce and professional development with respect to TVET, and further collaboration between countries for the advancement of TVET within primary and secondary education. The relevance of TVET to everyday life and greater access and equality within TVET were also expressed as research interests.

Participants further noted that in order to motivate greater interest in TVET, there is a need for greater funding, capacity building and networking. This was suggested alongside changing the perception of TVET as only leading to low-class occupations and as not being a university-level pursuit.

## TVET insights with high-quality evidence

TVET research in SSA is not systematic and not always of high quality. Around 20% of the relevant publications reviewed were deemed as being of satisfactory relevance (and included on our 'H-list'), while less than 5% were considered to be of high relevance (and included on our 'U-list' of around 300 publications). Based on this categorisation, we identified the key challenges for TVET and TVET research identified in the higher-quality research, namely: the development of TVET institutions, the promotion and growth of TVET staff numbers, the improvement of the image and perception of TVET and the importance of ICT in TVET.

Within the reviewed publications, evidence regarding the impact of TVET on developmental processes, i.e., development impact, is often inadequately researched and, unfortunately, of limited validity. In particular, the evaluation of the impact of specific TVET programmes is limited. Deficiencies affecting the internal and external validity of the results are due to the low sample sizes and the failure to control statistically important variables. Often, only one-off surveys are carried out, using purely qualitative methods that rely only on self-reported data without triangulation. Studies with higher quality designs produce diverse insights into the impact of the programmes. Although some successful results have been documented, this is far from being the case for all projects.

## Insights into TVET policy

There are a number of recommendations for TVET policy and policymakers. These recommendations include a broader investment in TVET resources, an intensified push for meaningful completion of TVET

(i.e., meaningful qualifications), strengthened practice orientation of TVET, extended TVET-teacher education, increased networking of TVET providers including experts from industry and business, as well as greater attention to — and involvement with — the informal sector (informal work, informal TVET). With regard to TVET providers, greater emphasis on the more effective use of ICT in teaching and learning is demanded; it is clear that such use of ICT would also require a revision of existing TVET programmes. Ideas for further research include taking advantage of findings from fields adjacent to TVET (e.g., social science, education; also findings pertaining to higher education in general). Furthermore, there are opportunities for building on or extending findings from existing studies, particularly on the impact of policy.

## Insights into TVET models

TVET is undertaken in a variety of different models across SSA. There is no single conceptualisation of what TVET is, what a TVET model should entail, or indeed how TVET is implemented. TVET models differ in how they are delivered, including the place of delivery (e.g., college vs. workplace), and more generally in the balance between involved practical vs. theoretical elements within teaching. Models also differ in the level of formality of the programme (formal college enrolment vs. informal workplace learning). The colonial history of specific countries is also a factor. For example, there are similarities in the research literature regarding the types of TVET practised in francophone countries compared to anglophone countries; however, these similarities appear minor in comparison with differences between nations.

Despite these differences in the conceptualisation and practice of TVET, we have been able to group the various models into five categories, as described below. Where initial TVET is concerned, models can be classified according to the extent to which they focus on practice (cooperative dimension, 'K' based on the German term 'Kooperativ') into five overlapping models: K1, K2, K3, Z4 and Z5.

Type K1 models utilise a predominantly theory-based approach. This type of models is the second most

common approach besides the K3 models. Such approaches are utilised, for example, in the health professions and the craft sector (as evidenced in South Africa, Cameroon, Uganda and Kenya).

Type K2 models are less common; they aim at college-based education with a large practical component. In such models, practical and theoretical components may be equally weighted. Such models share aspects with so-called ‘dual TVET systems’, which have been tested by a number of states in SSA (Ethiopia, Mozambique, Mali, Malawi, Botswana, Tanzania). ‘Dual systems’ recognising that both limited theoretical knowledge as well as inadequate practical experience obstruct the successful entry into professional life.

Type K3 models encompass informal education and can be found across SSA. As a rule, they consist entirely of informal work-based training, taking place almost exclusively at the workplace. Although this form of TVET is well established in many settings, it is often poorly recognised, and not addressed by TVET policy.

This classification of initial TVET is augmented by two further approaches that usually occur at later stages (temporal dimension, ‘Z’ based on the German term ‘Zeit’). These are Type Z4 models, which focus on technology-supported distance learning (both initial and in-service), and Type Z5 models, which focus on in-service approaches and continuing professional development (CPD). This classification is not conceptual, but heuristic in nature, designed to capture the types of TVET discussed in the literature. Such programmes are of shorter duration, typically informal and used very widely; we did not detect specific patterns for some countries participating more than others.

We found that publications considering the pedagogical requirements of TVET educators and teachers typically come to the conclusion that a stronger emphasis must be placed on practice-focused TVET. The aim should be to offer interactive TVET, in which authentic practice-relevant tasks are solved. However, researchers’ attention is not focused solely on the cost-effectiveness and relevance of TVET for the labour market. Additionally, TVET needs to be understood not as a nar-

rowly focused acquisition of technical skills, but as opportunities for general education, which help learners to develop personally, to develop a critical understanding, and to take responsibility within society. This perspective offers opportunities for development and innovation not only from an economic but also from a societal perspective. While the personal development of learners is mentioned in conjunction with entrepreneurship, overall, the TVET sector appears to not place emphasis on the personal development of learners. Extending the perspective on general education to TVET, such perspectives can be realised by a pedagogical approach to TVET that is critical and competence-oriented; such an approach needs to promote student-centred teaching and reflective learning (Chapter 13). If the issue of personal development and education is neglected (as is often the case in informal education), students may become vulnerable to exploitation and ill-treatment in the workplace (Chapter 13).

## Inclusion-related challenges

There are far-reaching inclusion-related challenges in TVET and TVET policy (Chapter 9). For example, inclusion tends to focus on the extent to which women are included in TVET education but rarely consider broader discussions regarding gender identity that are prevalent in higher-income countries. We note that all of the gender-focused publications acknowledge that women’s TVET-related skills and competencies are naturally the same as men’s. Nevertheless, TVET and workplaces often do not recognise this. Publications from Ethiopia, Ghana, Uganda, Mozambique, Benin and Burkina Faso indicate that women are often unable to utilise their skills because the relevant opportunities for TVET are not always available to them. Researchers from Tanzania, Zambia and Zimbabwe found that women often do not even consider apprenticeships. Furthermore, when women do engage in workplace training, as in Western countries, it is less likely to be in a highly technical subject, such as engineering, and more likely to be in, for example, healthcare (c.f., publications from Ghana, Kenya, Benin, Congo, Burkina Faso and Mozambique). Teachers / educators play a central role in addressing gender equity, so their

education should become an important field of research (c.f., publications from Ghana, Nigeria, Sierra Leone, Gambia, Liberia and Malawi).

Studies from Ghana, Ethiopia, Tanzania, South Africa and in particular Kenya, focus on both the right to and availability of equitable access to TVET for all people, thus touching on inclusion issues that focus on TVET for people with disabilities. According to these studies, disability issues are neglected in both education policy and in the necessary statutory provisions.

Refugees in SSA must also be considered partly as vulnerable groups in terms of TVET. Indeed, TVET may offer opportunities for refugees to improve their circumstances. Refugee status can also have an impact on inclusion. One study from Uganda indicates that TVET for refugees can be a way to integrate them into a new community. The expert participants in the interviews also highlighted the current focus of research exploring TVET programmes for immigrants in Nigeria, who themselves are often vulnerable.

We emphasise, however, that young people — including those with formal TVET — may be disadvantaged compared to older people in the labour market. This is due, in part, to the overly theoretical TVET available to young people and — on completion of the TVET — their limited experience in the workplace.

We note that most of the documents reviewed in this report simply indicate that access to TVET needs to be facilitated for minority groups and that governments and state authorities should be encouraged to do so. However, specific suggestions as to how this could be implemented in practice— or has already been implemented — are rarely found in the literature, and even then are often not very informative.

Overall, we recommend mainstreaming gender aspects and gender equality issues in future research, and developing targeted support for vulnerable groups, including young people and refugees.

## Key stakeholders in TVET

Another important topic of this report is key stakeholders in TVET (Chapter 10). For selected countries (Botswana, Ghana, Kenya and Nigeria), the chapter provides a review of the institutions involved in the planning, implementation and evaluation of TVET and those that manage the administration of the corresponding TVET-related processes. Such stakeholders are also direct users of research results. For example, the Botswana Training Authority (BOTA) is developing guidelines and strategic plans for the country's TVET system.

Our internet research indicates that, in most SSA countries, the Ministry of Education and / or the Ministry of Labour are the main governmental authorities for the decision-making and management of the TVET system at the national level. However, specific ministries are often responsible for the provision and delivery of TVET programmes that relate to their specific economic sector. This complicates the overarching educational design and delivery of TVET.

There is research on TVET policy in the four countries considered. However, there is no evidence of the research findings have had any actual impact on TVET policy or on the action of key stakeholders — either at the national or regional levels. Future TVET research should explore how the impact of key-stakeholder research can be better utilised in the administration of TVET processes.

A demographic overview of the key stakeholders in TVET research is also available (Chapter 5). This includes leading institutions and countries in TVET, as well as the academic faculties and departments that participate in TVET research.

## Non-state actors

Chapter 11 sets out the role of non-state actors in TVET in selected countries (Ethiopia, Botswana, Ghana, Kenya, Nigeria, Tanzania and Uganda). There is a notable presence of non-state-controlled and private TVET providers in these countries. Such providers

often already have — or seek — a degree of influence on the national TVET system. The non-governmental sector comprises large companies, nonprofit organisations, voluntary organisations and NGOs. They have varying degrees of involvement in formulating policy, developing curricula, determining priorities for occupational standards, forecasting future labour demand, and setting indicators for curricula and the quality of work-based education. A good example is Nigeria, where non-governmental bodies offer a real alternative to state providers of higher education for teachers and curriculum development. In Kenya, there is evidence that remarkable work is being done in the private TVET sector. In both Kenya and Botswana, state efforts are being made to involve industry and other stakeholders in the design of TVET.

We note that these insights come from internet research, and it is important to note that data on private TVET providers are inconsistent throughout our dataset. In particular, we did not come across research on the role of the industry as a promoter and beneficiary of TVET. Clearly, furthering cooperation efforts between public and non-governmental TVET institutions would be beneficial and profitable for all those involved in TVET.

We did not discern any evidence of influence on TVET by non-governmental partners, such as unions or (crafts-)guilds. However, it should be remembered that unions certainly play an important national role in SSA, despite not appearing in the TVET literature we reviewed.

## National standards, guidelines and regulations

The reviewed literature does not provide much insight into national standards for TVET in SSA (Chapter 12). However, some states in SSA have informative, well-structured and well-maintained websites on all aspects of their TVET systems. However, there were other states where the government websites were not functioning, could only be accessed intermittently, or were not accessible at all.

Botswana, Ghana, Kenya, Mauritius, Malawi, Nigeria, Uganda, South Africa and Tanzania all have national qualification frameworks for education. Such qualifications set minimum requirements for the classification, registration and accreditation of national qualifications and certificates. In some countries (Ghana, Kenya, Uganda and Tanzania), the frameworks also detail the educational approaches to be followed. In each of these countries, competence-oriented education is recommended. Qualification frameworks specifically for TVET were found only in Botswana, Ghana and Uganda.

Information is provided on some governmental websites (Botswana, Ghana, Kenya, Nigeria, Uganda and South Africa) regarding their responsibility for regulating, accrediting and monitoring TVET. These governments have developed standards for TVET, the quality requirements for which they publish (partially), and for which they monitor compliance (partially).

Whenever the pedagogical approach was mentioned in official documents, competency-based education was unanimously the preferred choice. Although the definition of 'competency-based' is not explicitly clarified, it can be seen from the contexts that the Anglo-Saxon competency-based approach is the inspiration in most cases.

## Challenges to policy implementation

Several promising and viable approaches to TVET governance were apparent in a number of countries (Chapter 13). While there is some general research on education policy, few publications are concerned with the adequacy, development and testing of TVET policies or standards. Reports often state that evaluation processes are taking place, but do not describe how these studies are structured and carried out methodologically. It appears that such research has had little impact on national standards and guidelines for TVET. Further research is necessary.

In the evaluated publications, it becomes clear that some of the states involved in the study set themselves very ambitious goals in TVET — including the development of work-focused and competence-oriented TVET. In particular, the effects of TVET policy changes on the classroom-pedagogical level are examined. In Kenya, for example, significant changes in classroom activity can be identified as an outcome of the change in pedagogical guidelines. It is clear, however, that the implementation of these changes poses a great challenge for states in SSA and their TVET authorities. This is an important area for future research.

Publications also mention that the insufficient (and often neglected) financing of the TVET sector compared to other areas of education acts as a barrier to the implementation of reforms (Chapter 13). If competency- and job-oriented education is desired, greater engagement is needed with the private sector and the job market, and their engagement with the TVET system.

There is a limited number of research papers on the different effects of informal education. Young people value informal education because it is considered cost-effective and easily accessible. In addition, it often appears to offer better employment opportunities than formal education. However, insights from Nigeria also highlight the dangers of the unrestrained exploitation of the vulnerable groups that are enabled through informal education. TVET agencies tend to be aware of the opportunities and dangers of TVET without state quality assurance mechanisms. Research into the impacts and the models used could help to understand and further develop informal approaches; this might be helpful in developing guidelines for the protection of vulnerable groups.

The effectiveness of government policy on inclusion-related goals is unclear. One of the few studies available found that there is still a significant segmentation by ethnicity and gender within the TVET sector (South Africa, see Chapter 13). TVET systems much desire positive changes towards gender mainstreaming and equality for all people; however, the development

and implementation of measures that contribute to this is barely controlled or supported. This is another important area for future research.

## Insights regarding institutional frameworks and research capacity

The interview and focus groups participants provided insights into institutional frameworks and research capacity-building (Chapter 14). They particularly noted the challenges associated with unfavourable institutional framework conditions and research capacities, as well as how those challenges might be addressed. Currently, the main challenge is insufficient funds for conducting research; funding limitations are related to an inability to provide competitive salaries to highly-skilled researchers and appropriate equipment for research and conference attendance sponsorship. Other challenges are a lack of clear institutional leadership surrounding the TVET research agenda, as well as insufficient regard for the importance of research. Skills shortage in the region is an issue, specifically, a shortage of quantitative research skill expertise, and expertise in working with large datasets.

Participants suggested a range of measures to address the challenges facing institutional frameworks and research capacity building. One suggestion is to undertake more conferences and other events, as well as utilising other tools that facilitate networking and the sharing of ideas. Such activities would also contribute to filling current skills gaps.

## Actors and networks in TVET research

TVET research in SSA is not well developed. For example, we found no TVET-related publications for almost one-third of the nations in SSA (13 nations). Therefore, the question of actors and networks in TVET research in SSA is a particularly important one. TVET is conducted at state and private universities as well as



independent institutes across various disciplines. A large percentage of the publications relate to TVET in East Africa and Southern Africa (including South Africa). While Ghana and Nigeria (in West Africa) have some of the highest numbers of TVET-related research publications of all SSA nations, overall there are relatively few publications from West and Central Africa.

The agencies that fund TVET research include the United Kingdom Department for International Development (DFID), the United Nations International Children's Fund (UNICEF) and The Fogarty International Center. Regarding SSA-led TVET research networks, our interviews and internet research found some evidence of their existence (Chapter 15). However, the identification of such networks was not an easy task; networks are not centrally recorded; nor are they a focus for donors.

The most commonly found networks (e.g., UNEVOC) focus on all aspects of TVET and not specifically TVET research. Two networks, the Réseau Africain des Institutions de Formation de Formateurs de l'Enseignement Technique (RAIFFERT) and the European Research Network on Vocational Education and Training (VET-Net) focus on TVET-research in SSA (Chapter 15). The International Conference for the professional development of French-speaking engineers and technicians (CITEF) was also mentioned as a conference that facilitates international collaboration. Also mentioned were a number of organisations and conferences that facilitate networking around TVET within the SSA region more exclusively. Of particular interest is the network initiated by Kenya's Technical and Vocational Education and Training Authority (TVETA). There are, of course, also intergovernmental organisations that are not necessarily TVET focused, but that do address TVET concerns to varying degrees. Examples of these include the African Union, the European Centre for Development Policy Management, and the New Partnership for Africa's Development (NEPAD).

While we were unable to find many or indeed large networks other than UNEVOC, the need for networking opportunities is a clear outcome of the interview and focus groups. The focus groups and interviews not only explored what TVET networks and networking opportunities exist, but also how those networks help to build research capacity in SSA. Generally speaking, participants noted that networks are an important factor in improving research capacity across SSA. Networks and networking are considered helpful in knowledge and skills exchange and research dissemination. However, there is a shared understanding that the need to build and sustain research networks is plagued by a lack of resources – financial, human and material. Further limitations to networking efforts include the lack of awareness of networks and networking opportunities that currently exist. Concerning networking, we also note the apparent lack of connections between anglophone and francophone countries, which should be explored. Barriers due to the colonial past still exist, and prevent joint research and development in TVET, despite often very similar settings.

In response to these limitations, participants in the focus groups discussed creating a 'virtual' research community. Instead of intensifying commitment to research in a small selection of countries or institutions, a 'virtual' research community can be made up of participants from different African countries and institutions. We appreciate, however, that even with the promise of virtual research networks, there is a desire, and need, for face-to-face opportunities for networking. In light of this, the focus group participants suggest that efforts should be made to create a list of relevant TVET conferences and researchers across SSA, work toward securing more financial support to facilitate networking opportunities, and present research results more actively, as well as to conduct workshops on research and research methods.

[gəʊ][vi:] [i:] [ti:]

**GO:VET**

 German Office for International Cooperation  
in Vocational Education and Training

GOVET  
at Federal Institute for VET (BIBB)  
Robert-Schuman-Platz 3  
D-53175 Bonn  
[govet@govet.international](mailto:govet@govet.international)  
[www.govet.international](http://www.govet.international)